



Full Length Article

Toxicity and Bioaccumulation of Metals (Al and Co) in Three Economically Important Carnivorous Fish Species of Pakistan

Sidra Abbas^{1*}, Muhammad Javed¹, Hammad Ahmad Khan¹ and Khalil-ur-Rahman²

¹Department of Zoology, Wildlife and Fisheries, Faculty of Sciences, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad, Pakistan

²Department of Biochemistry, Faculty of Sciences, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad, Pakistan

*For correspondence: sidraabbas2012@hotmail.com

Abstract

The acute toxicity of aluminum (Al) and cobalt (Co), in terms of both 96 h LC₅₀ and lethal concentrations, was determined for three fish species viz. *Channa marulius*, *Mystus seenghala* and *Wallago attu* under controlled laboratory conditions. The experiments were performed at constant water temperature (28°C), pH (8) and total hardness (250 mg L⁻¹). At the end of toxicity trials, the dead fish were dissected, digested and then analyzed for respective exposure metal's concentrations in various body organs viz. gills, liver, kidney, heart, gut, intestine, muscles, bones and skin. There existed statistically significant variations at p<0.05 among the three fish species toward Al and Co acute toxicities (96 h LC₅₀ and lethal concentrations) that followed the order: *C. marulius*>*W. attu*>*M. seenghala*. Statistically all the three species of fish were found more sensitive to Al than Co toxicity. During acute concentrations exposure, *C. marulius* exhibited significantly higher potential to accumulate Al and Co in its body followed by *W. attu* and *M. seenghala*. At both 96 h LC₅₀ and lethal concentration exposures, all the three carnivorous fish species had significantly (p<0.05) higher tendency to concentrate both metals in their liver, followed by the kidney, gills, heart, gut, intestine, bones and skin. However, they exhibited significantly lower Al and Co concentrations in their muscles. The overall accumulation pattern of metals in the bodies of all three carnivorous fish species followed the order: Co>Al. © 2018 Friends Science Publishers

Keywords: Carnivorous fish; Metal toxicity; 96 h LC₅₀; Lethal concentration; Bioaccumulation

Introduction

Industrially developing countries, including Pakistan, are facing a severe threat to the stability of their freshwater ecosystems due to the metallic ions pollution (Chen *et al.*, 2011). Owing to the non-biodegradability and ability to bio-concentrate in various organs, metals produce toxic effects in the aquatic organisms (Mendil *et al.*, 2005). The main toxic effects result from metallic ions exposure are the production of reactive oxygen species and damage to the DNA (Zeeshan *et al.*, 2017). The elevated concentrations of metals may cause various metabolic, physiological and behavioral alterations in the aquatic animals (Li *et al.*, 2010). Among the aquatic organisms, carnivorous fish species are more susceptible to the contamination as they reside at the higher trophic level of aquatic food chain (Subotic *et al.*, 2013). Hence, they could better indicate the pollution status of their respective ecosystem (Stergiou and Karpouzi, 2002). Aluminum (Al) does not have any biological function and is readily transferred through the food chains (Fallah *et al.*, 2011). However, it enters into the aquatic environs as a pollutant through mining activities, water treatment plants as they employ alum (aluminum sulphate) for removal of suspended solid particles from

water and through industrial effluents discharge. In rivers, acid precipitation has led to enhanced concentrations of trace element (i.e., Al), which may eventually result into huge fish mortality (Selvam *et al.*, 2014). Cobalt (Co) serves as an integral component of cobalamin or vitamin B₁₂ and hence considered as a vital element for the organisms (Blust, 2012). The combustion of fossil fuel, mining, industrial and agricultural wastes are predominant sources of Co discharge into the aquatic environments (Kim *et al.*, 2006). Exposure of metals such as Al and Co may adversely affects development, behavior and viability of fish (Howe *et al.*, 2014).

The characteristic property of an organism's response toward a chemical at a specific dosage or concentration for a specific period of time is the toxicity (Johnson and Radhakrishnan, 2015). In order to assess the potential toxic impacts of chemicals on the biology of aquatic animals and to evaluate their effects for a short time interval usually exposure for 96 h, the acute toxicity assays are designed (Haloi *et al.*, 2014). The tolerance limits of different fish species toward metal toxicity could be evaluated by quantitative parameters such as survival or mortality of the test organism (Reda *et al.*, 2010). The study related to accumulation of xenobiotics in various fish tissues provide

insight about the pollution level of any aquatic ecosystem along with the possible harms of contaminated fish consumption (Shukla *et al.*, 2007).

The population of three economically important carnivorous fish species viz. *Channa marulius*, *Mystus seenghala* and *Wallago attu* in riverine systems of Pakistan is declining (Rafique and Khan, 2012) because of uncontrolled and increasing metals contamination from the last several decades. This necessitates the determination of toxic effects of commonly found contaminants such as Al and Co to the three carnivorous fish species so that water quality guidelines could be devised in order to conserve the nutritionally significant fish species of Pakistan. Thus, the objectives of present study were to ascertain acute toxicity of Al and Co, in terms of 96 h LC₅₀ and lethal concentrations, for the three carnivorous fish species viz. *C. marulius*, *M. seenghala* and *W. attu* and their accumulation in the body organs of fish.

Materials and Methods

The research work was conducted in the laboratories of Fisheries Research Farms, Department of Zoology, Wildlife and Fisheries, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad, Pakistan. The tolerance limits of three fish species viz. *C. marulius*, *M. seenghala* and *W. attu* were determined for Al and Co, separately, in terms of both 96 h LC₅₀ and lethal concentrations. Three fish species were obtained from Head Qadirabad and brought to the wet laboratory for acclimatization in cemented tanks for two weeks. The fish were fed pelleted feed having 40% digestible protein and 3.50 kcal g⁻¹ energy, thrice a day. However, fish were not fed during acute toxicity experiments. After acclimatization, the healthy individuals of 100 mm total lengths, for each fish species, were selected for acute toxicity trials. The average wet weights for each of the three fish species exposed separately to Al and Co are shown in Table 1.

Chemically pure compounds of Al (AlCl₃.6H₂O) and Co (CoCl₂.6H₂O) were dissolved, separately, in 1000 mL deionized water and stock solutions prepared for each metal. The toxicity tests were conducted in glass aquaria of 50 L water capacity at constant water temperature, pH and total hardness of 28°C, 8 and 250 mg L⁻¹, respectively.

Determination of 96 h LC₅₀ and Lethal Concentrations

Ten individuals of each fish species were placed in each aquarium, with three replications for each test dose. The concentration of exposed metals was started from zero with an increment of 0.01 and 0.1 mg L⁻¹ for low and high concentrations, respectively. The concentration of metals in each aquarium was increased gradually and 50% test concentration maintained within 3 h and full toxicant concentration in 6 h. Each exposure concentration was tested with three replications, separately for each fish species. To prevent any lowering of the exposed metals

concentration, the media were renewed and the metallic ions concentration maintained after every 24 h. Constant aeration of the aquarium water was done with an air pump fitted with capillary system. During acute toxicity trials, the observations on fish mortality were made after every 2 h. The metals exposure concentrations were started from zero up to that concentration at which 50% (LC₅₀) and 100% mortality of fish (lethal concentration) occurred during 96 h. The dead fish were immediately removed from the test media and mortality data were recorded. During the whole experimental period, the physico-chemical variables of the test media viz. dissolved oxygen, carbondioxide, total ammonia, electrical conductivity, calcium, magnesium, sodium and potassium were analyzed on 12 h basis following the methods of APHA (2012).

Determination of Metals in Fish Body Organs

At the end of each acute toxicity trial of metals, dead fish were dissected and their gills, liver, kidney, heart, gut, intestine, muscles, bones and skin isolated. Fish organs were digested in HNO₃ and HClO₄ (3:1 V/V) by following the methods of SMEWW (1989) for the determination of respective exposure metal (µg g⁻¹) using Atomic Absorption Spectrophotometer (Perkin Elmer, AAnalyst-400).

Statistical Analyses

The acute toxicities of metals (Al and Co) were computed by using Probit analysis method (Hamilton *et al.*, 1977). Mean values of 96 h LC₅₀ and lethal concentrations of metals for each fish species were obtained at 95% confidence intervals. Data were statistically analyzed by using Factorial experiments (RCBD), while means were compared for statistical differences by employing Tukey's/Student Newman-Keul test (Steel *et al.*, 1996).

Results

Toxicity

96 h LC₅₀: There existed statistically significant differences among three fish species towards Al toxicity. *M. seenghala* was significantly more sensitive to Al than *W. attu* and *C. marulius*, in terms of mean 96 h LC₅₀ values. Statistically significant (p<0.05) variations were found for Co toxicity, among all the fish species. The tolerance limits of three fish species towards Co, in terms of mean 96 h LC₅₀ values, followed the order: *C. marulius*>*W. attu*>*M. seenghala*. Al was found significantly more toxic to all the three carnivorous fish species than Co (Table 2).

96 h lethal concentrations: The mean lethal concentrations of Al for the fish species varied significantly between 75.56 and 164.85 mg L⁻¹ as determined for *M. seenghala* and *C. marulius*, respectively. Among the fish species, *C. marulius* was significantly more tolerant to Co toxicity having mean

lethal concentration value of 201.04 mg L⁻¹ (confidence interval of 192.37–215.11 mg L⁻¹), followed by *W. attu* and *M. seenghala*. Regarding overall toxicity of metals, Co was relatively less toxic to the fish than Al (Table 2).

Bioaccumulation

During 96 h LC₅₀ exposure: All the three fish species exhibited (p<0.05) variable ability to concentrate Al in their bodies. Among the three carnivorous fish species, *C. marulius* had significantly greater potential to accumulate Al, followed by *W. attu* and *M. seenghala*. The overall pattern of Al accumulation in the selected body organs of three fish species differed significantly with the mean higher concentration in the liver, followed by kidney, gills, heart, gut, intestine, bones, skin and muscles. However, *C. marulius* had significantly higher mean metal concentration in its kidney, followed by liver, gills and heart. The order of Al accumulation in *M. seenghala* was liver > kidney > heart > gills ≥ gut > intestine. All the three species of fish exhibited significantly least Al amassing in their muscles (Table 3).

M. seenghala had significantly lesser Co concentration in its body organs than other two fish species. All the three fish species had significantly higher Co concentration in their liver while had lower concentration in skin and muscles. *W. attu* exhibited significantly higher concentration of Co in its liver, followed by that of kidney, heart, gills, gut, intestine and bones.

During 96 h lethal concentration exposure: Among the three species of fish, *C. marulius* exhibited significantly higher mean Al concentration in its body organs, followed by *W. attu* and *M. seenghala*. All the three carnivorous fish species had significantly (p<0.05) higher tendency to concentrate Al in their liver, followed by kidney, gills, heart, gut, intestine, bones, skin and muscles. However, *M. seenghala* exhibited greater potential to accumulate Al in its kidney, followed by liver, gills and heart (Table 3).

During 96 h lethal concentration exposure of Co, statistically significant variations were observed toward metal accumulation, among all the three carnivorous fish species. The order of Co accumulation in bodies of three fish species was *C. marulius*>*W. attu*>*M. seenghala*. All the three fish species exhibited significantly greater potential to bioconcentrate Co in their liver, followed by kidney, gills, heart, gut, intestine, bones and skin while had significantly lesser ability to accumulate the same in their muscles.

Table 4 shows the overall accumulation pattern of metals (Al and Co) in the bodies of three carnivorous fish species, at 96 h acute (LC₅₀ and lethal concentration) exposures. During 96 h LC₅₀ exposure, all the three fish species exhibited significantly higher ability to amass Co (146.52 µg g⁻¹) in their bodies than Al (124.03 µg g⁻¹). During 96 h lethal concentrations exposure, the overall accumulation of metals in the bodies of all the three fish species followed the order: Co>Al.

Table 1: Average wet weights of 100mm fish used for Al and Co acute toxicity trials

Treatment/Metal	Species	Average wet weight (g)
Al	<i>C. marulius</i>	5.32±0.15
	<i>M. seenghala</i>	4.76±0.11
	<i>W. attu</i>	9.28±0.24
Co	<i>C. marulius</i>	4.66±0.17
	<i>M. seenghala</i>	4.29±0.09
	<i>W. attu</i>	9.53±0.21

Table 2: Calculated mean 96 h LC₅₀ and lethal concentrations of metals for three fish species

Species	Treatments		*Overall Means
	Al	Co	
96 h LC ₅₀			
<i>C. marulius</i>	114.97±3.28 a	158.90±2.96 a	136.94±31.06 a
<i>M. seenghala</i>	45.52±2.44 c	80.01±3.07 c	62.77±24.39 c
<i>W. attu</i>	74.24±2.66 b	92.36±2.62 b	83.30±12.81 b
Overall Means	78.24±34.90 b	110.42±42.43 a	
96 h lethal concentrations			
<i>C. marulius</i>	164.85±7.54 a	201.04±5.42 a	182.95±25.59 a
<i>M. seenghala</i>	75.56±4.94 c	120.62±5.84 c	98.09±31.86 c
<i>W. attu</i>	109.13±5.06 b	127.51±5.05 b	118.32±13.00 b
Overall Means	116.51±45.10 b	149.72±44.57 a	

Means with different letters in a single column and *row are statistically significant at p<0.05

Discussion

The discharge of metallic ions into the natural water bodies of Pakistan has caused serious issues such as; (i) mortality of carnivorous fish resulting into a substantial decline in their density and diversity, and (ii) accumulation of metals in the various body organs of carnivorous fish hence, making them unfit for human consumption. The results of present investigation showed that there existed significant (p<0.05) variations among the three carnivorous fish species regarding their abilities to tolerate the metals. The mean 96 h LC₅₀ and lethal concentration values showed that *M. seenghala* was more sensitive to both Al and Co, followed by *W. attu* and *C. marulius* (Table 2). This may be due to the fact that inherent potential to tolerate the metallic ions stress varied from one species to another. The variations in toxicity of even the same metal to different fish species is linked to the differential metabolic and physiological rates of each fish species (Kaushal and Mishra, 2013). The metals after being taken up by the individual affect the activity of certain enzymes either by displacing or completely blocking the enzymes required for normal metabolic activities and also alter the normal immune system functioning (Torres *et al.*, 2008; Authman *et al.*, 2015). During present acute toxicity trials, all the three carnivorous fish species were found significantly more sensitive to Al than Co toxicity.

The individual effects of both these metals (Al and Co) were variable since each metal has a specific mode of action to cause toxicity to the exposed organism. However, both of these are the potential genotoxicants (Figgitt *et al.*, 2010; Garcia-Medina *et al.*, 2011).

Table 3: Accumulation of metals ($\mu\text{g g}^{-1}\pm\text{SD}$) in the body organs of fish during acute concentrations exposure

Species	Organs									*Means \pm SD
	Gills	Liver	Kidney	Heart	Gut	Intestine	Muscles	Bones	Skin	
96 h LC ₅₀ exposure										
Al										
<i>C. marulius</i>	242.34 \pm 0.32 c	309.54 \pm 0.35b	327.29 \pm 0.39 a	222.36 \pm 0.28 d	197.62 \pm 0.25 e	121.18 \pm 0.22 g	44.95 \pm 0.09 i	132.84 \pm 0.23 f	68.19 \pm 0.18 h	185.15 \pm 100.41 a
<i>M. seenghala</i>	75.61 \pm 0.21 d	138.77 \pm 0.27a	106.44 \pm 0.26 b	80.99 \pm 0.19 c	74.53 \pm 0.17 d	51.79 \pm 0.15 e	22.82 \pm 0.06 h	29.56 \pm 0.10 g	36.30 \pm 0.13 f	68.53 \pm 37.98 c
<i>W. attu</i>	155.29 \pm 0.28 c	225.36 \pm 0.36a	182.37 \pm 0.33 b	136.45 \pm 0.26 d	115.28 \pm 0.22 e	94.65 \pm 0.19 f	30.16 \pm 0.05 i	75.40 \pm 0.21 g	50.82 \pm 0.08 h	118.42 \pm 63.24b
Means \pm SD	157.75 \pm 83.39 c	224.56 \pm 85.39a	205.37 \pm 112.21b	146.60 \pm 71.23 d	129.14 \pm 62.71e	89.21 \pm 35.01 f	32.64 \pm 11.27 i	79.27 \pm 51.75 g	51.77 \pm 15.97 h	
Co										
<i>C. marulius</i>	282.18 \pm 0.27 c	375.25 \pm 0.24a	345.82 \pm 0.20 b	247.52 \pm 0.38 d	208.15 \pm 0.33 e	177.35 \pm 0.27 f	57.16 \pm 0.08 i	135.70 \pm 0.23 g	79.15 \pm 0.17 h	212.03 \pm 111.47 a
<i>M. seenghala</i>	103.29 \pm 0.19 c	177.06 \pm 0.15a	123.31 \pm 0.23 b	96.18 \pm 0.27 d	77.60 \pm 0.14 f	82.22 \pm 0.18 e	32.05 \pm 0.08 i	52.42 \pm 0.06 g	38.39 \pm 0.02 h	86.95 \pm 45.37 c
<i>W. attu</i>	166.10 \pm 0.24 d	244.10 \pm 0.13a	198.25 \pm 0.12 b	175.23 \pm 0.29 c	153.52 \pm 0.29 e	140.69 \pm 0.26 f	43.92 \pm 0.07 i	86.13 \pm 0.18 g	57.40 \pm 0.11 h	140.59 \pm 66.42b
Means \pm SD	183.86 \pm 90.76 c	265.47 \pm 100.81a	222.46 \pm 113.21b	172.98 \pm 75.70 d	146.42 \pm 65.56e	133.42 \pm 47.98f	44.38 \pm 12.56 i	91.42 \pm 41.89 g	58.31 \pm 20.40 h	
96 h lethal concentration exposure										
Al										
<i>C. marulius</i>	651.65 \pm 0.45 c	754.80 \pm 0.53 a	706.33 \pm 0.51 b	629.89 \pm 0.44 d	510.60 \pm 0.38 e	427.11 \pm 0.33 f	56.78 \pm 0.07 i	314.07 \pm 0.29 g	162.68 \pm 0.24 h	468.21 \pm 247.11 a
<i>M. seenghala</i>	517.89 \pm 0.38 c	582.12 \pm 0.42 b	621.05 \pm 0.40 a	463.14 \pm 0.33 d	387.42 \pm 0.27 e	288.39 \pm 0.21 f	42.03 \pm 0.08 i	199.59 \pm 0.16 g	101.05 \pm 0.12 h	355.85 \pm 209.96c
<i>W. attu</i>	552.20 \pm 0.43 c	704.36 \pm 0.56 a	668.92 \pm 0.52 b	507.05 \pm 0.46 d	468.09 \pm 0.41 e	395.65 \pm 0.38 f	49.15 \pm 0.11 i	220.36 \pm 0.32 g	139.14 \pm 0.26 h	411.66 \pm 230.87b
Means \pm SD	573.91 \pm 69.47 c	680.43 \pm 88.79 a	665.43 \pm 42.75 b	533.36 \pm 86.43 d	455.37 \pm 62.57e	370.38 \pm 72.73f	49.32 \pm 7.38 i	244.67 \pm 60.99 g	134.29 \pm 31.10h	
Co										
<i>C. marulius</i>	702.19 \pm 0.34 c	986.91 \pm 0.29 a	867.27 \pm 0.27 b	683.30 \pm 0.63 d	570.08 \pm 0.52e	492.88 \pm 0.44 f	69.25 \pm 0.10 i	375.61 \pm 0.42 g	254.22 \pm 0.37 h	555.75 \pm 292.59a
<i>M. seenghala</i>	645.54 \pm 0.21 c	904.25 \pm 0.19 a	735.38 \pm 0.31 b	527.12 \pm 0.56 d	402.46 \pm 0.43 e	339.11 \pm 0.31 f	48.31 \pm 0.09 i	132.59 \pm 0.18 h	159.30 \pm 0.20 g	432.67 \pm 293.78 c
<i>W. attu</i>	672.63 \pm 0.30 c	954.82 \pm 0.16 a	769.41 \pm 0.15 b	604.59 \pm 0.42 d	539.13 \pm 0.36 e	436.57 \pm 0.29 f	65.82 \pm 0.10 i	308.47 \pm 0.22 g	198.47 \pm 0.16 h	505.55 \pm 283.19b
Means \pm SD	673.45 \pm 28.33 c	948.66 \pm 41.67 a	790.69 \pm 68.47 b	605.00 \pm 78.09 d	503.89 \pm 89.19e	422.85 \pm 77.80 f	61.13 \pm 11.23 i	272.22 \pm 125.50g	204.00 \pm 47.70 h	

Means with different letters within a single row and *column are statistically significant at p<0.05

Table 4: Overall accumulation ($\mu\text{g g}^{-1}\pm\text{SD}$) of metals in the fish during 96 h exposure to acute concentrations of metals

Species	Treatments($\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$ of tissue)		
	Al	Co	*Overall means
96 h LC ₅₀ exposure			
<i>C. marulius</i>	185.15 \pm 100.41 b	212.03 \pm 111.47 a	198.59 \pm 19.01 a
<i>M. seenghala</i>	68.53 \pm 37.98 b	86.95 \pm 45.37 a	77.74 \pm 13.02 c
<i>W. attu</i>	118.42 \pm 63.24 b	140.59 \pm 66.42 a	129.51 \pm 15.68 b
Overall Means	124.03 \pm 58.51 b	146.52 \pm 62.75 a	
96 h lethal concentration exposure			
<i>C. marulius</i>	468.21 \pm 247.11 b	555.75 \pm 292.59 a	511.98 \pm 61.90 a
<i>M. seenghala</i>	355.85 \pm 209.96 b	432.67 \pm 293.78 a	394.26 \pm 54.32 c
<i>W. attu</i>	411.66 \pm 230.87 b	505.55 \pm 283.19 a	458.61 \pm 66.39 b
Overall Means	411.91 \pm 56.18 b	497.99 \pm 61.89 a	

Means with different letters in a single row and *column are statistically

Al toxicity involves oxidative damage to the tissues, chromosomal aberrations, DNA strand breaks, production of micronuclei and cell apoptosis, ultimately lead towards fish mortality (Ternjej *et al.*, 2010). The exposure of elevated Co concentrations results in excessive generation of reactive oxygen species causing damage to the DNA hence, may affects the survival of fish (Alarifi *et al.*, 2013).

The accumulation of metals in the bodies of three carnivorous fish species differed significantly (p<0.05) and followed the order: *C. marulius*>*W. attu*>*M. seenghala*. In the present investigation, we found that all the three fish species accumulated a higher amount of Co than Al (Table 4). The accumulation of metallic ions in the body of fish depends on ecological needs, feeding habitats, species, metabolism of the fish, metal's concentration and the route by which they get absorb i.e. either water or food (Mziray and Kimirei, 2016). Each fish species has differential ability to absorb, regulate and detoxify the metals within the body (Qadir and Malik, 2011). The metals interact with Ca²⁺ATPases of the plasma membrane and hence enter into the cell (Ballatori, 2002). After absorption in the fish body,

the metals are transferred by the blood stream to the various body organs where either they are detoxified, accumulated or excreted (Weber *et al.*, 2013). During 96 h LC₅₀ and lethal concentration exposures, it was found that overall accumulation pattern of metals in the body organs of fish varied significantly and followed the order: liver > kidney > gills > heart > gut > intestine > bones > skin > muscles. The inconstant amassing of metals in different organs of fish is related to the variable metabolic and physiological rates of each organ.

The metals accumulation in fish induces various enzymatic and histopathological alterations (Lionetto *et al.*, 2000; Giari *et al.*, 2007). As a result of elevated metallic ions concentration, the production of metallothioneins increases in the liver and kidney that ultimately bind the metals with them in order to avoid the possible harms to the living system. This situation leads to enhanced metal concentrations in the liver as this organ is principally involved in detoxification processes (Amiard *et al.*, 2006; Zhao *et al.*, 2012). Kidney is also considered as one of the important organs for metal's accumulation as it is involved

in reabsorption and excretion processes (Barbier *et al.*, 2005). The gills are associated with continuous gas exchange mechanisms due to which the water-borne toxicants remain in direct contact with them, and hence amass higher amounts of metallic ions (Oliveira-Filho *et al.*, 2010). The variable amassing of metals in the heart, gut, intestine, bones and skin of the fish is attributed to the differential exposure, absorption, regulation, retention and excretion rates of these organs (Storelli *et al.*, 2006). During present investigation, the accumulation of Al and Co in muscles of all the carnivorous fish species was found minimum (Table 3) as they are metabolically less active than all the other studied organs (Elnabris *et al.*, 2013).

Conclusion

Significant differences were observed among the three carnivorous fish species for the acute toxicity of metals, in terms of 96 h LC₅₀ and lethal concentration values. Al was found more toxic to all the fish species than Co. During 96 h LC₅₀ and lethal concentrations exposure, *C. marulius* exhibited higher propensity to accumulate both the metals in its body than *W. attu* and *M. seenghala*. All these carnivorous fish species showed a greater tendency to concentrate the metals in liver followed by the kidney, gills, heart, gut, intestine, bones and skin and the lowest in their muscles.

Acknowledgements

The research work was performed under the project No. 285 granted by the Pakistan Science Foundation, Islamabad (Pakistan) to second author.

References

- APHA, 2012. American Public Health Association. *Standard Methods for the Examination of Water and Wastewater*, p: 1193, 20th edition. American Public Health Association, New York, USA
- Alarifi, S., D. Ali, A.O. Suliman, M. Ahamed, M.A. Siddiqui and A.A. Al-Khedhairi, 2013. Oxidative stress contributes to cobalt oxide nanoparticles-induced cytotoxicity and DNA damage in human hepatocarcinoma cells. *Int. J. Nanomed.*, 8: 189–199
- Amiard, J.C., C. Amiard-Triquet, S. Barka, J. Pellerin and P.S. Rainbow, 2006. Metallothioneins in aquatic invertebrates: their role in metal detoxification and their use as biomarkers. *Aquat. Toxicol.*, 76: 160–202
- Authman, M.N., M.S. Zaki, E.A. Khallaf and H.H. Abbas, 2015. Use of fish as bio-indicator of the effects of heavy metals pollution. *Aquac. Res. Dev.*, 6: 1–13
- Ballatori, N., 2002. Transport of toxic metals by molecular mimicry. *Environ. Health Persp.*, 110: 689–694
- Barbier, O., G. Jacquillet, M. Tauc, M. Cougnon and P. Poujeol, 2005. Effect of heavy metals on, and handling by, the kidney. *Nephrol. Physiol.*, 99: 105–110
- Blust, R., 2012. Cobalt. In: *Fish Physiology: Homeostasis and Toxicology of Essential Metals*, pp: 291–326. Wood, C.M. (ed.). 31A Academic Press, London
- Chen, C., Y. Qian, Q. Chen and C. Li, 2011. Assessment of daily intake of toxic elements due to consumption of vegetable, fruits, meat, and seafood by inhabitants of Xiamen, China. *J. Food Sci.*, 76: 181–188
- Elnabris, K.J., S.K. Muzyed and N.M. El-Ashgar, 2013. Heavy metal concentrations in some commercially important fishes and their contribution to heavy metals exposure in Palestinian people of Gaza Strip (Palestine). *J. Assoc. Arab U. Basic Appl. Sci.*, 13: 44–51
- Fallah, J.A., F. Zeynali, S.S. Saei-Dehkordi, M. Rahnama and T. Jafari, 2011. Seasonal bioaccumulation of toxic trace elements in economically important fish species from the Caspian Sea using GFAAS. *J. Verbr. Lebensm.*, 6: 367–374
- Figgitt, M., R. Newson, I.J. Leslie, J. Fisher, E. Ingham and C.P. Case, 2010. The genotoxicity of physiological concentrations of chromium (Cr(III) and Cr(VI)) and cobalt (Co(II)): An in vitro study. *Mutat. Res.-Fund. Mol. M.*, 688: 53–61
- Garcia-Medina, S., C. Razo-Estrada, M. Galar-Martinez, E. Cortez-Barberena, L.M. Gomez-Olivan, I. Alvarez-Gonzalez and E.M. Bujaidar, 2011. Genotoxic and cytotoxic effects induced by aluminum in the lymphocytes of the common carp (*Cyprinus carpio*). *Comp. Biochem. Phys. C*, 153: 113–118
- Giari, L., L.M. Manera, E. Simoni and B.S. Dezfuli, 2007. Cellular alterations in different organs of European sea bass *Dicentrarchus labrax* (L.) exposed to cadmium. *Chemosphere*, 67: 1171–1181
- Haloi, K., M. Kalita and A. Borkotoki, 2014. Acute toxicity of endosulfan on *Channa punctatus* (Bloch.). *Int. J. Res. Environ. Sci. Technol.*, 4: 88–92
- Hamilton, M.A., R.C. Russo and R.V. Thurston, 1977. Trimmed Spearman-Kärber method for estimating median lethal concentration in toxicity bioassays. *Environ. Sci. Technol.*, 11: 714–719
- Howe, P.L., A.J. Reichelt-Brushett and M.W. Clark, 2014. Investigating lethal and sublethal effects of the trace metals cadmium, cobalt, lead, nickel and zinc on the anemone *Aiptasia pulchella*, a cnidarian representative for ecotoxicology in tropical marine environments. *Mar. Freshwater Res.*, 65: 551–561
- Johnson, C. and M.V. Radhakrishnan, 2015. Estimation of acute toxicity of chromium to the freshwater catfish *Clarias batrachus* (Linn.) *Int. J. Res. Environ. Sci.*, 1: 30–37
- Kaushal, B.T. and A. Mishra, 2013. Investigation of acute toxicity of cadmium on snake head fish *Channa punctatus*-A comparative toxicity analysis on median lethal concentration. *Int. J. Adv. Biol. Res.*, 3: 289–294
- Kim, J.H., H.J. Gibb and P.D. Howe, 2006. *Concise International Chemical Assessment Document 69: Cobalt and Inorganic Cobalt Compounds*, pp: 1–93. World Health Organization, Geneva, Switzerland
- Li, Z.H., V. Zlabek, P. Li, R. Grabic, J. Velisek, J. Machova and T. Randak, 2010. Biochemical and physiological responses in liver and muscle of rainbow trout after long-term exposure to propiconazole. *Ecotoxicol. Environ. Saf.*, 73: 1391–1396
- Lionetto, M.G., M.E. Giordano, S. Vilella and T. Schettino, 2000. Inhibition of eel enzymatic activities by cadmium. *Aquat. Toxicol.*, 48: 561–571
- Mendil, D., O.D. Uluozlu, E. Hasdemir, M. Tuzen, H. Sari and M. Suicmez, 2005. Determination of trace metal levels in seven fish species in lakes in Tokat, Turkey. *Food Chem.*, 90: 175–179
- Mziray, P. and I.A. Kimirei, 2016. Bioaccumulation of heavy metals in marine fishes (*Siganus sutor*, *Lethrinus harak*, and *Rastrelliger kanagurta*) from Dar es Salaam Tanzania. *Reg. Stud. Mar. Sci.*, 7: 72–80
- Oliveira-Filho, E.C., D.H.F. Muniz, M.F.N. Ferreira and C.K. Grisolia, 2010. Evaluation of acute toxicity, cytotoxicity and genotoxicity of a nickel mining waste to *Oreochromis niloticus*. *B. Environ. Contam. Toxicol.*, 85: 467–471
- Qadir, A. and R.N. Malik, 2011. Heavy metals in eight edible fish species from two polluted tributaries (Aik and Palkhu) of the River Chenab, Pakistan. *Biol. Trace Elem. Res.*, 143: 1524–1540
- Rafique, M. and N.H. Khan, 2012. Distribution and status of significant freshwater fishes of Pakistan. *Rec. Zool. Surv. Pak.*, 21: 90–95
- Reda, F.A., A.M. Bakr, S.A. Kamel, Sheba and R.A. Doaa, 2010. A mathematical model for estimating the LC₅₀ or LD₅₀ among an in set life cycle. *Egypt. Acad. J. Biol. Sci.*, 32: 75–81
- SMEWW, 1989. *Standard Methods for the Examination of Water and Wastewater*, 17th edition. Washington DC, USA

- Selvam, A., R. Anandhan and V. Kavitha, 2014. Acute toxicity of aluminum chloride to freshwater fish *Labeo rohita* (Ham). *Int. J. Res. Fish. Aquacult.*, 4: 104–107
- Shukla, V., M. Dhankhar, J. Prakash and K.V. Sastry, 2007. Bioaccumulation of Zn, Cu and Cd in *Channa punctatus*. *J. Environ. Biol.*, 28: 395–397
- Steel, R.G.D., J.H. Torrie and D.A. Dickey, 1996. *Principles and Procedures of Statistics: A Biometrical Approach*, 3rd edition. McGraw-Hill Co., Singapore
- Stergiou, K.I. and V.S. Karpouzi, 2002. Feeding habits and trophic levels of Mediterranean fish. *Rev. Fish Biol. Fisher.*, 11: 217–254
- Storelli, M.M., G. Barone, A. Storelli and G.O. Marcotrigiano, 2006. Trace metals in tissues of mugilids (*Mugil auratus*, *Mugil capito*, and *Mugil labrosus*) from the Mediterranean Sea. *B. Environ. Contam. Toxicol.*, 7: 43–50
- Subotic, S., S. Spasic, Z. Visnjic-Jeftic, A. Hegedis, J. Krpo-Cetkovic, B. Mickovic, S. Skoric and M. Lenhardt, 2013. Heavy metal and trace element bioaccumulation in target tissues of four edible fish species from the Danube River (Serbia). *Ecotoxicol. Environ. Saf.*, 98: 196–202
- Ternjej, I., Z. Mihaljevic, I. Stankovic, M. Kerovec, L. Sipos, D. Zeljezic and N. Kopjar, 2010. Estimation of DNA integrity in blood cells of eastern mosquitofish (*Gambusia holbrooki*) inhabiting an aluminum-polluted water environment: an alkaline comet assay study. *Arch. Environ. Contam. Toxicol.*, 59: 182–193
- Torres, M.A., M.P. Barros, C.G. Sara, E.P. Campos, R. Satish, T. Richard, T. Sayre and C. Pio, 2008. Biochemical biomarkers in algae and marine pollution: A review. *Ecotoxicol. Environ. Saf.*, p: 71
- Weber, P., E.R. Behr, C.D.L. Knorr, D.S. Vendruscolo, E.M.M. Flores, V.L. Dressler and B. Baldisserotto, 2013. Metals in the water, sediment, and tissues of two fish species from different trophic levels in a subtropical Brazilian river. *Microchem. J.*, 106: 61–66
- Zeeshan, M., A. Murugadas, S. Ghaskadbi, B.R. Ramaswamy and M.A. Akbarsha, 2017. Ecotoxicological assessment of cobalt using Hydra model: ROS, oxidative stress, DNA damage, cell cycle arrest, and apoptosis as mechanisms of toxicity. *Environ. Pollut.*, 224: 54–69
- Zhao, S., C. Feng, W. Quan, X. Chen, J. Niu and Z. Shen, 2012. Role of living environments in the accumulation characteristics of heavy metals in fishes and crabs in the Yangtze River Estuary, China. *Mar. Pollut. Bull.*, 64: 1163–1171

(Received 31 October 2017; Accepted 20 January 2018)